

DATE: September 5, 2013

FILE: 5360-20/CR

TO: Chair and Directors
Comox Valley Regional District (Comox Strathcona waste management) board

FROM: Debra Oakman, CMA
Chief Administrative Officer

RE: CRWMC waste relocation contract award

Purpose

The purpose of this report is to request approval from the Comox Strathcona waste management (CSWM) board to direct award a contract for waste relocation at the Campbell River waste management centre (CRWMC) for closure preparation contract to Berry and Vale Contracting Ltd.

Policy analysis

The CSWM service area covers the Comox Valley and Strathcona regional districts' geographical areas; and is operated by the Comox Valley Regional District (CVRD) under letters patent. The service was established under Bylaw No. 1822 being "Regional Solid Waste Plan Local Service Area Establishment Bylaw No. 1822, 1996" to establish and operate a local service for the collection, removal and disposal of municipal solid waste. Fees and charges for this service are provided for under Bylaw No. 170 being "Solid Waste Fees and Charges Bylaw No. 170, 2011", so that annual costs may be recovered.

Direct award contract direction is covered under Bylaw 75:

1.4.13.13 Where the competitive process is impractical because of the need to obtain unique third party skills, there is a requirement for contractor continuity, or there is a strong case for the cost effectiveness of maintaining a current contractor for a specific task;

Executive summary

Justification under Bylaw 75 for direct award of contract:

1. Third party knowledge/skills: waste excavation and placement may be hazardous and is dangerous to those with no experience and qualifications. Berry and Vale have experience and landfill management qualifications as well as a successful Worksafe BC record as a primary contractor operating two landfills in BC for over fifteen years.
2. Cost effectiveness: the last two tenures received from Berry and Vale for earthwork and waste relocation, Berry and Vale underbid all competitors by over \$100,000 and over 200 per cent, respectively.
3. Continuity: familiar with CVRD requirements and standards through successful completion of previous work.

The CRWMC phase one waste relocation, closure preparation, portion of the work is included in the attached tender analysis letter from SCS Engineers (Appendix 'A'). This work will prepare the waste grade elevations for the mechanically stabilized earthen wall and the slope closure along Argonaut Road scheduled to commence in the spring of 2014.

This work was included in a tender issued in June 2013 in which the only tender received came in substantially over budget. Tenderers expressed concern about the strict requirements for movement of waste and this may have been a factor in why only one tender was submitted. A quote was requested from Berry and Vale, the onsite contractor with experience in complying with the requirements for the movement of waste. The quote from Berry and Vale for this portion of the work is over 200 per cent lower than the tender received in July 2013, and below the June 2013 SCS Engineering professional construction estimate for the work in this contract.

This CRWMC closure work is part of the CSWM board strategic plan and has been approved by the Ministry of Environment in the plan review document dated March 2013.

Recommendation from the chief administrative officer:

THAT subject to a notice of intent to direct award being posted on the Comox Strathcona waste management website, a contract be awarded to Berry and Vale Contracting Ltd for the Campbell River waste management center waste relocation closure preparation project in an amount not to exceed \$315,907.20 plus applicable taxes;

AND FURTHER THAT the chair and corporate legislative officer be authorized to execute the contract.

Respectfully:

D. Oakman

Debra Oakman, CMA
Chief Administrative Officer

Options

1. The board authorizes award of contract
2. The board does not authorize the award of contract

Staff recommends option 1.

Financial factors

Funding for this project is authorized under function No. 391 and is part of the 2013 capital works budget for CRWMC – CR closure for CSWM service.

Prepared by:

Concurrence:

T. Boatman

T. Ian Smith

Thomas A. Boatman, PE
Manager of Solid Waste

T. Ian Smith, MCE
General Manager of Community Services

Attachments: Appendix A – SCS “tender assessment letter”

SCS ENGINEERS

September 3, 2013
File No. 04212022.04

submitted via e-mail to: tboatman@comoxvalleyrd.ca

Mr. Tom Boatman, PE
Comox Valley Regional District
600 Comox Road
Courtenay, BC V9N 3P6
Canada

Subject: Evaluation of Barry and Vale Contracting, Ltd. Tender – Closure Preparation,
Campbell River Waste Management Centre (CRWMC)

Dear Mr. Boatman:

SCS Engineers (SCS) provided drawings of grading areas, technical specifications, and a Tender Form regarding closure preparation services to the Comox Valley Regional District (CVRD) and Barry and Vale Contracting, Ltd. (B&V) on August 23, 2013.

A completed Tender Form was received for this project from B&V on September 3, 2013. The following presents an evaluation and recommendation of the submittal received regarding the Closure Preparation at the CRWMC and includes a comparison of the tender to the engineer's cost estimate, see Attachment A.

TENDER RESULTS AND EVALUATION

SCS reviewed the tender price received from B&V and it is our opinion that it is an acceptable responsive Tender. The pricing of \$315,907.20 provided by B&V is approximately \$47,500 (13 percent) below the engineers cost estimate of \$363,379.59.

RECOMMENDATIONS

Given that the cost to perform the work is lower than the engineers cost estimate, we believe that the CVRD should accept the Tender for the Closure Preparation Services.



CLOSING

SCS greatly appreciates the opportunity to assist the CVRD with engineering services related to the Closure Construction at the CRWMC. If there are any questions regarding information presented herein, please do not hesitate to contact the undersigned.

Sincerely,



Eric M. Sonsthagen, PE (WA)
Senior Project Professional
SCS ENGINEERS



John M. Richards, PE (WA)
Project Director
SCS ENGINEERS

ES/jr

Attachment A Engineers Cost Estimate

Attachment A

Engineers Cost Estimate

Tender Form					
Item #	Description of Work	Unit	Approx. Quantity	Unit Price	Extended Amount
1	General				
1	Mobilization and Demobilization	ls	1	\$ 16,479.80	\$ 16,479.80
2	Site Work				
2	Logging, Clearing and Grubbing	m ²	2,100	\$ 5.00	\$ 10,500.00
3	Waste Relocation				
3	Landfill Waste - Excavation	m ³	30,100	\$ 4.73	\$ 142,373.00
4	Landfill Waste - Placement and Compaction	m ³	30,100	\$ 4.73	\$ 142,373.00
4	Soil Relocation				
5	East Soil Mound Relocation	m ³	3,900	\$ 4.00	\$ 15,600.00
5	Final Cover System				
6	Supply and Place 300 mm Thick Foundation Layer	m ³	5,000	\$ 3.75	\$ 18,750.00
			Sub-Total		\$ 346,075.80
			GST (5%)		\$ 17,303.79
			TOTAL TENDER PRICE		\$ 363,379.59

ls = Lump Sum
m² = Square Metre
m³ = Cubic Metre